

Sub: Mumbai Trans Harbour Link (MTHL)

– Minutes of the 2nd meeting of coordination Committee constituted for formulation of guidelines for the compensation to be paid to the project affected fishermen along with JICA Fact finding mission held on 18/11/2015 in MMRDA office

Following were present for the meeting.

Meeting chaired by	Mr. Sanjay Khandare, Addl. Metropolitan Commissioner – II MMRDA
Members of JICA Study Team	Mr. Jun WATANBE, Director, Env. & Social Consideration Review Div.
	Ms. Ai KOGA, Sr. Safeguard Office, Social Consideration Review Div.
	Ms. Kyoko MATSUMOTO, Sr. Safeguard Office, Env. & Social Consideration Review Div.
	MR. Shinya NAGOKA, M/s OCGL, JICA study Team
	MR. KUROKI, M/s OCGL, JICA study Team
	MR. Vivek Kulkarni, BEIPL, JICA study Team
	Mr. Kolhatkar, BEIPL, JICA study Team
Committee Members	Mr. M B Gaikwad, Commissioner, Fisheries, MS
	Mr. V. U. NAik, Dy. Commissioner, Fisheries, MS
	Representative from office of DCP (Zone II) Panvel Division, Navi Mumbai
	Mr. Ajit Sakhane, Dy. Collector Mumbai City
	Mr. P D Mamdapure, Engineer in Chief, ED
MMRDA Officials	Mr. Vishram Patil, Chief R & R
	Mr. S. S. Varaskar, Superintending Engineer, MMRDA
	Mr. Ravindra Mathapati, Dy. Collector, MMRDA
	Mr. M. H. Paranjape, Exdecutive Engineer, MMRDA

The following is the gist of discussions:

On the outset Hon. AMC –II welcomed all present and explained that the purpose of the meeting is to apprise JICA study team about the steps taken by MMRDA to draw a compensation policy for the project affected fishermen.

Mr. Vivek Kulkarni with the help of Power Point presentation presented the draft methodology for drawing the compensation policy.

Mr. Vivek Kulkarni presented the matrix prepared depending on the type of losses likely to incur due to construction of MTHL. He explained that the losses that may incur are divided in six categories namely C1 to C6. As follows

C1, C2 and C3 are for the loss of permanent nature to the fishermen families.

- C1:- Due to construction of MTHL the 'dol' nets (about 25 to 50 nos) and 'sus' stakes that would be permanently displaced from traditional fishing area,
- C2:- Dol nets operate efficiently at certain current velocity. Due to construction of piers there will slight reduction in the tidal currents to the extent of about 10%. Therefore fish catch would be lowered to some extent. Loss of high catch would be considered permanent loss up to 50%.
- C3:- Due to construction activity of MTHL the subsistence fisher folks would not be able to catch crabs, oysters, bivalve and sand fish in a particular area.

C4 & C5 are for losses of temporary nature due to construction activity

- C4:- For reaching to the regular fishing ground and coming back to marketing Warfs the fishing boats will be required to use designated navigation channels and would have to take detour and travel longer distance. Hence operating cost shall increase during the construction period. It was informed that there were about 300 nos of commercial boats and 175 nos of artisanal boats operating in the area. Margin is also required to be kept for non-licensed boats, details of which would be provided by the fisheries dept.
- C5:- During construction activity there will be constant movement of barges carrying construction material, also drilling and piling activity would cause disturbance to sea bed, thereby increase in turbidity. As most fish species are sensitive to suspended solids, this may result in migration of fish to clearer waters.

C6 is for the losses towards incidental causes like accidental collision of fishing boats with barges, fishing nets getting damaged due to movement of barges etc. around 200 incidents are assumed to occur during construction period.

Mr. Vivek Kulkarni explained that with his past experience in the field and with the discussions with a few fishermen in the area the compensation payable is estimate in the range of Rs 48 to Rs. 62 Cr. over a period of 5 years.

AMC enquired about how the losses would be ascertained. Mr. Kulkarni explained that the data shall be collected from fishermen which need to be supported by the income proof. Else income of about 2.50 lacs pa shall be considered for calculating compensation.

AMC directed to adopt the procedure of actual survey of the quantum of catch and costing shall be arrived based on actual losses incurred.

Mr. Vivek Kulkarni further explained to the Committee the objective of survey, methodology for carrying out survey and Reporting to determine the probable financial losses to the fishermen. It was informed to the Committee that the total time required for conducting survey and finalizing compensation shall be around 5 months. During survey all the villages need to be identified, but so far 9 villages have been considered. The estimate for fish catch per boat would be done with data during 3 spring tides.

JICA team posed the following questions:

1. How compensation shall be disbursed: - AMC II explained that the compensation finalized would be disbursed through the district collector as per the legal procedure, which involves steps mentioned below:
 - (a) The detail survey and estimation of losses in respect of parameters C1 to C6 mentioned above shall be worked out.
 - (b) Concurrence from fisher folks to the estimated losses through their representatives shall be obtained.
 - (c) The Estimate for losses shall be put up before committee for recommendation.
 - (d) On recommendation by committee the approval from Competent Authority shall be obtained.
 - (e) The disbursement of compensation shall be done through District Collector at the appropriate time as per categories mentioned above.
2. The compensation shall be in stages or one time: - The compensation payable would be on one time or as & when basis depending on the category of losses. However, the same shall be paid when actual losses occur to the fishermen due to MTHL construction activity.
3. What will be compensation if project is delayed for certain period: - The compensation shall be calculated on the actual basis for the delay period and disbursed to the fishermen as per procedure and as decided by the Committee.

- 4. Whether the consent of fishermen shall be taken and at what stage: - The chairman of the fishermen societies would be invited during Committee meeting. The compensation policy shall be finalized in consultation with them taking in to consideration their suggestions if any. The Committee shall explain the policy to the members of the societies.
- 5. JICA suggested to have Public consultation before finalizing the compensation policy: It was explained that the Chairmen of the fishermen societies are the representatives of the fishermen and compensation policy shall be framed taking in to consideration the suggestions made by them. However, public consultation will be done once the policy is prepared prior to its implementation. The suggestions if any shall be incorporated as may be required.
- 6. What is Mechanism for redressal of grievances: - Mr. Vishram Patil explained that MMRDA would have grievance redressal unit for the PAP's under project.
- 7. What shall be schedule for framing compensation policy: - It was informed that the general compensation policy would be finalized by 5th December 2015. Detail survey, public consultation, photographs and documentation would be carried out subsequently.

It was decided to conduct next meeting on 30/11/2015 at 3.0 pm wherein the Chairmen of fishermen societies would be invited. Fisheries department will share the contact details of the societies of the fishermen.

Meeting ended with a Vote of thanks to the Chair.


Engineer-in-Chief & Member Secretary