

490

ITEM NO 1(iii)

MINUTES OF THE 147TH MEETING OF THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE,
B.M.R.D.A.

DATE : 10th November, 1992 (Tuesday)
TIME : 9.00 A.M.
PLACE : Chief Secretary's Committee Room, 5th Floor, Mantralaya.

MEMBERS PRESENT :

- Shri S. Ramamoorthi, Chief Secretary to Government. - Chairman
- Shri Shirish B. Patel. - Member
- Shri D.T. Joseph, Secretary (I) to Government, Urban Development Department. - Member
- Shri Navin Kumar, Secretary to Government, Housing & Special Assistance Department. - Member
- Shri S.G. Kale, Municipal Commissioner, Bombay Municipal Corporation. - Member
- Shri R.C. Sinha, Managing Director, CIDCO. - Member
- Shri P. Subrahmanyam, Metropolitan Commissioner. - Member

INVITEES :

- Shri Anupam Dasgupta, Secretary (II) to Government, Urban Development Department.
- Shri K.N. Patel, Legal Adviser, BMRDA.
- Shri V.K. Phatak, Chief, Planning Division, BMRDA.
- Shri K.B. Diwadkar, Chief, Town & Country Planning Division, BMRDA.
- Shri G.K. Deshpande, Chief, Transport & Communications Division, BMRDA.
- Shri V.D. Borkar, Chief Engineer, Engineering Division, BMRDA.

Shri K.R. Shanbhogue,
Chief Accounts Officer,
Finance & Accounts Division, BMRDA.

SPECIAL INVITEES :

Shri D.M. Sukthankar.

Shri P.M. Apte.

Prof. Soli Arceivala,
Managing Director,
Associated Industrial Consultants (I) Pvt. Ltd.

Shri Ratnakar Gaikwad,
Chief Executive Officer,
MHADA.

Shri S.V. Asgaonkar, Secretary, Executive Committee, BMRDA.

Item No.1 : Confirmation of the minutes of the 144th Meeting of the Committee.

The minutes were confirmed.

Item No.2 :

Consideration of the following papers related to Regional Plan for Bombay Metropolitan Region which could not be considered at the Committee's meeting held on the 17th October, 1992 was then resumed :-

- (i) Employment Scene in BMR.
- (ii) Shelter Needs and Strategies for BMR.
- (iii) Major Issues for consideration.

2.1 Shri V.K. Phatak, Chief, Planning Division presented through a slide-show working papers on Shelter and Employment and highlighted major issues in the context of revision of Regional Plan. The paper on 'Shelter' evoked considerable discussion, particularly, on population projections, estimate of shelter requirement, land requirement, household income and affordability.

2.2 Shri Shirish Patel felt that the projection of population for the Rest of BMR (BMR excluding Greater Bombay) for the period 2001-2011 appeared unrealistic. However, the alternative scenario of projections presented during the discussion was considered to be more realistic. As the ratio method has been adopted for BMR projections, it was

reported that India's population projection of the 8th Five Year Plan will be used as the basis for finalising the BMR projections. Shri R.C. Sinha, Managing Director, CIDCO wanted to know about the rate of growth of income assumed for projection of the income distribution. (This however could not be readily checked during the course of the meeting. On verification from Annexure-II (Page 52 and 53) of the working paper on Shelter, it is seen that a growth rate of 3% p.a. in per capita income is assumed for projection of income distribution). Shri Sinha questioned the basis of arriving at the estimate that the current rate of construction of houses in the formal sector was about 50,000 per year. Shri V.K. Phatak listed various sources used in arriving at the estimate of current rate of construction of houses in BMR. He pointed out that availability of the data on the housing activity in BMR. was generally very poor.

2.3 Some of the members questioned the appropriateness of utilisation of lower FSI than otherwise permissible in a sites and services programme which they felt results in higher land requirement. Shri V.K. Phatak explained that various combinations of plot area and built up area are possible in a sites and services approach. He further explained that this allows utilisation of remaining permissible FSI by the poor households through addition of built up space during the process of incremental house construction. Shri Sharad Kale, Municipal Commissioner, Municipal Corporation of Greater Bombay, raised the question of availability of land in the Residential Zone for future shelter requirements in Greater Bombay. Problems of using salt pan land were also discussed in this context. Shri Sharad Kale suggested that the various assumptions made in the shelter working paper should be consistent with those made in the Industrial Policy, Employment, Land use Policy, etc. Shri V.K. Phatak said that the various working papers will be synthesised in the draft revised Regional Plan in a consistent way.

2.4 Referring to the suggestion in the shelter working paper to encourage urban renewal of large areas and to invite equity participation of the tenants of the old

dilapidated buildings, Shri Sharad Kale felt that it was not feasible, as such renewal would offer opportunity for capital gains to tenants only on sale. He however felt that the tenants may stand to gain by way of better accommodation. Citing example of Kamathipura Urban Renewal Scheme, Shri D.M. Sukthankar observed that the concept might be feasible if extra FSI was available and part of the land could be exploited for commercial purpose. The Metropolitan Commissioner informed the Committee about the strategies being followed to involve builders, developers and other parties in development of District Centre at Oshiware.

2.5 Shri D.T. Joseph wondered why in spite of permitting FSI upto 2.5, slum dwellers' co-operative societies were not coming forward to take up redevelopment. He felt that organizing slum dwellers is a stupendous task and the efforts of MHADA in this regard would continue to be very limited. He suggested that new institutional mechanism should be created to catalyse such redevelopment. Shri D.M. Sukthankar said that the present policy offered various incentives for redevelopment but there was no disincentive or punishment in the policy for not redeveloping slums. Shri V.K. Phatak indicated that only in the case of 35% of all the slums redevelopment programme would be feasible on account of consideration of density and market price parameters. He observed that improvement programme on the lines of Slum Upgradation Programme (SUP) will be more suitable which could then lead to gradual redevelopment initiated by the co-operative societies of the slum dwellers. On the issue of institutional mechanism he explained that presently civil engineers form the major part of MHADA's staff and hence it is not well equipped to adopt a 'Facilitator' role. He therefore suggested that instead of creating new institutions, the community development efforts need to be intensified and the Community Development Wing in MHADA could be strengthened.

2.6 As regards the approach to the New Regional Plan, Shri Shirish Patel expressed a view that the desirable target should first be identified. Policies and strategies should then be formulated to achieve this. It was, however, brought to the notice that this approach was followed in

the 1970-91 Regional Plan preparation, but it had achieved very limited success. Shri Sharad Kale, Municipal Commissioner, MCGB, emphasised the need to segregate controllable and uncontrollable variables that effect the final outcome of regional growth. Shri D.T. Joseph, Secretary(T) to Government, U.D. doubted if the Plan be revised only because of expiry of time period. In his opinion the implementation factor should play more important part while deciding to revise the Plan. Shri D.M. Sukthankar countered the argument saying that the basic assumptions and socio-economic environment had undergone a tremendous change over the last 20 years and it was very much necessary to prepare a new Plan in the light of the changed circumstances even though there was no assurance that the substantial part of the new Plan would get implemented. He made a strong case for including the health and education sectors in the proposed Regional Plan. The Metropolitan Commissioner pointed out that according to the MR&TP Act, the planning for health and education was outside the purview of the Regional Plan. Shri D.T. Joseph argued that at least future needs of these sectors in terms of broad location and land requirement in various parts of the Region may be worked out so that any Development Plan for a given area could be amended if such indications are available.

2.7 Reacting to the major issues raised in the context of the Regional Plan, Shri Sharad Kale suggested that rather than 'promoting' economic growth, the efforts should be made to 'channelise' it. He welcomed the idea of developing International Finance and Business Centre in Bombay, but felt that unless transport and particularly communication links are vastly improved, such a centre will not be successful. He thought that Bombay was being left out of the race in international business growth, mainly because of the lack of necessary infrastructure facilities. Agreeing with Shri Sharad Kale, the Chairman suggested that the idea of developing an international finance and business centre should be explored further. He agreed with the concept of recycling valuable land locked in old or obsolete industries or in BPT area, but citing examples of BPT, Iron & Steel Market, Grain Godowns etc. cautioned that such a proposal was fraught with numerous difficulties.

2.8 On the question of creating institutional mechanism for improved co-ordination at the regional level, the Metropolitan Commissioner observed that the Executive Committee headed by the Chief Secretary, was the right forum to achieve this co-ordination and that it had been functioning effectively. Shri D.M. Sukthankar suggested that part of the Plan-funds in various sectors could be pooled under BMRDA, which on the basis of an Investment Plan can direct these funds to right agencies for right projects. According to him, this would give BMRDA adequate leverage to achieve necessary co-ordination. In this context it was observed that co-ordination could be more effective if it is backed by finances. BMRDA's development finance role would therefore be critical in this regard. Shri Shirish Patel expressed similar views.

2.9 Shri D.T. Joseph observed that the Revenue and Forests Department, which through the Collector was responsible for controlling development in the outer areas of the Region, and the Home (Transport) Department were not in any way involved in the BMRDA's policy making process. He said that BMRDA does not have any link with the development planning process at local level and that it was necessary that the BMRDA provided policy and other guidance to the Local Authorities and Town Planning Department in the preparation of Development Plan for smaller towns and cities in BMR.

2.10 Suggesting ways to increase BMRDA's effectiveness, Shri Sharad Kale stated that the BMRDA should develop expertise in planning, development and management of urban areas and extend its help and advice to various Local Authorities in the region and for this purpose, should build up necessary manpower. Supporting the view, Shri R.C. Sinha suggested that a Building Research Centre, especially for low cost housing could also be established under BMRDA. Shri D.M. Sukthankar also supported the idea and emphasised the need to establish Urban Management Institute which has been under discussion for quite some time.

2.11 Shri P.M. Apte observed that a Development Plan was an important document and often a basis for investment decisions. Yet, BMRDA, which is the Regional Planning and Co-ordinating Authority, had no clear, direct and statutory

role in either preparation or approval of the Development Plans for Urban Centres in the region. He suggested that MRTTP Act should be amended to substitute BMRDA for the Director of Town Planning to whom Development Plans in BMR should be referred for opinion before they are sanctioned by the Government. Shri D.T. Joseph said that it could be done easily, but what was more important was that the BMRDA should get involved at the preparatory stage and provide help and guidance in the preparation of the Development Plan.

2.12 Taking review of the work done so far on the Regional Plan, the Metropolitan Commissioner indicated that the land use plan would be presented in the next special meeting of the Executive Committee. He further indicated that the two important studies, one on 'transport' and other on 'environmental management strategy' which would have important bearing on the revised Regional Plan were launched and were expected to be completed only by September, 1993. But, the draft revised Regional Plan would have to be published well before that, preferably, by 31st March, 1993. Shri D.M. Sukthankar suggested that in that case, the changes necessary for incorporating the results of the two studies could be carried out before finalising the Regional Plan.

2.13 Shri P.M. Apte suggested that in order to elicit opinion, comments and suggestions on the revised Regional Plan from the experts, eminent persons and professional bodies, copies of the plans should be sent to them when it is published for public suggestions and objections. The Committee accepted the suggestion.

The following Item was then considered as Table Item with the permission of the Chair.

Table Item : Worli-Bandra Link Project.

The Committee approved the proposal contained in the Item Note and passed the following Resolution :-

RESOLUTION NO. 562 :

"RESOLVED THAT pending finalisation of agreement between Infrastructure Leasing & Financial Services Ltd. (IL&FS) and BMRDA and pending clearance to the project of

Worli-Bandra link from Environment and other Authorities, the Metropolitan Commissioner may invite jointly with the IL&S proposals for consultancy for the purpose of short-listing of suitable consultants. Such invitation of proposals will, however, involve no definite commitment nor any financial liability on BMRDA. The Metropolitan Commissioner be authorised to take suitable steps to formulate the evaluation procedure for the purpose of short-listing through the Steering Committee appointed for this project."

The meeting then concluded with a vote of thanks to the Chair.
